

## Expert Statement on Excellent Thesis Award Doctoral Programme in Physics and Materials Science

Dear *Name of the external expert*,

the doctoral candidate *Name of the doctoral candidate* has been proposed for the excellent thesis award of the University of Luxembourg. We rely on your expertise in the field and on your experience with doctoral education to select the best candidates.

The main criterion for the award is the scientific and/or technological excellence and impact of the thesis. Excellence and impact are confirmed by the novelty of the results, the progress in knowledge achieved by the thesis and in solutions presented.<sup>1</sup> Generally, excellence and impact are also manifested by research specific output, such as publications in respected and relevant journals or conferences, patents, publicly available datasets or software. The impact-factor of the journal should not be a criterion.<sup>2</sup> Further criteria for the award are the quality and clarity of the presentation of the results in the thesis.

We ask you in the following to rate the thesis and its results against a number of criteria on a scale from 1 to 10 (10 being the best score). If you prefer to use another form, that's fine, but please provide the information, that is asked on the next page.

<sup>1</sup> How does this work push the borders of knowledge? Has the scientific community gained an insight that it did not have before, an answer to a question or solution to a problem, where only the question or the problem existed before? Have we learned something relevant that was not known before? Can the society solve a technical problem that it could not solve before?

<sup>2</sup> The San Francisco Declaration on Research Assessment, <https://sfedora.org/>

1) Novelty	Score	<input type="text"/>
Please explain briefly, how the results of the thesis go significantly beyond the state of the art		
<i>Insert text here</i>		

2) Excellence and impact	Score	<input type="text"/>
Please explain briefly the importance and significance of the presented results. How do they pre-sent an important step forward in the field? How likely are the results to have a major impact on the re-search field?		
<i>Insert text here</i>		

3) Clarity of thesis presentation	Score	<input type="text"/>
Is the thesis particularly well and clearly written? Please explain your rating.		
<i>Insert text here</i>		

4) Based on your own experience of the last years: how would you rate this thesis among the doctoral theses you have encountered?	among the 10% best <input type="checkbox"/>
	among the 25% best <input type="checkbox"/>
	among the 50% best <input type="checkbox"/>

Place	Date	Name, Signature